APPLYING DALY’S PATHWAYS MODEL TO ORANGE IS THE NEW BLACK:
AN EXPLORATORY CONTENT ANALYSIS

A Thesis

Presented to the faculty of the Division of Criminal Justice
California State University, Sacramento

Submitted in partial satisfaction of the requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF SCIENCE

in

Criminal Justice

by

Kristen M. Estrada

FALL
2016
APPLYING DALY’S PATHWAYS MODEL TO ORANGE IS THE NEW BLACK:
AN EXPLORATORY CONTENT ANALYSIS

A Thesis

by

Kristen M. Estrada

Approved by:

__________________________________, Committee Chair
Jennie Singer, Ph.D.

__________________________________, Second Reader
Ryan Getty, Ph.D.

____________________________
Date
Student: Kristen M. Estrada

I certify that this student has met the requirements for format contained in the University format manual, and that this thesis is suitable for shelving in the Library and credit is to be awarded for the thesis.

__________________________, Graduate Coordinator
Ryan Getty, Ph.D.

Division of Criminal Justice
Abstract

of

APPLYING DALY’S PATHWAYS MODEL TO ORANGE IS THE NEW BLACK:
AN EXPLORATORY CONTENT ANALYSIS

by

Kristen M. Estrada

This study focuses on the positive utility of extant ‘real-life’ situations as they are portrayed on television. In order to explore the viability of tv portrayals as pedagogical tools, the popular show Orange is the New Black was selected for its relevance to elements of feminist criminology. This quantitative content analysis features a deductive approach where an inductive approach is more typical. Five raters were introduced to Kathleen Daly’s Pathways research and asked to watch the first season of Orange is the New Black to identify instances of Daly’s archetypal pathways. The results suggest that key themes of the Pathways perspective are present within the show and it may therefore have potential as an academic tool given proper context. It should be noted that the study was limited by the broad thematic approach to the Pathways perspective, as well as the knowledge of chosen raters (resulting in weak inter-rater reliability). Future research should seek to rectify low inter-rater reliability through more thorough training or selection of raters.

_______________________, Committee Chair
Jennie Singer, Ph.D.

_______________________
Date

iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The completion of this paper was a trial that required the cooperation of many people in my life. My sincere thanks are owed to countless people (and animals), not the least of which are listed here:

My committee, obviously. Dr. Singer and Dr. Getty were a joy to work with, and have calmed me out of panic at every turn.

My cohort, which seems like it came together ages ago, and has been a source of constant support since.

All the professors I encountered through coursework in this program: Dr. Escobar, Dr. Croisdale, Dr. Lee, Dr. Vizzard, Dr. Schnurbush, Dr. Farmer, and Dr. Singer (who certainly merits two mentions, if not more).

Everyone at the Division of Criminal Justice, especially Donna, without whom probably no student would ever graduate.

The group who volunteered their precious time in exchange for pizza & root beer: David, Josh, Kari, Katie, and Sam.

My family, for being generally supportive and for at least pretending to care.

My co-workers and boss, for happily picking up my slack around deadline times.

My friends, for understanding why I had to be boring for a while.

And of course my stupid dumb dogs (Bandito and Trooper (RIP)) with their stupid cute faces, whose very presence was comforting.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

| Acknowledgements | .................................................................................................................. v |
| List of Tables | .................................................................................................................. viii |

Chapter

1. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1

2. LITERATURE REVIEW .................................................................................................. 6
   Television and Criminal Justice Reality ........................................................................ 6
   Portrayals of Prison and Prisoners .............................................................................. 17
   Women Offenders and the Criminal Justice System ................................................... 23
   Theory ......................................................................................................................... 33
   Measurement .............................................................................................................. 36
   Summary ...................................................................................................................... 38

3. METHODS ................................................................................................................... 41
   Study Design ............................................................................................................... 41
   Subjects ....................................................................................................................... 41
   Measures ..................................................................................................................... 42
   Procedure .................................................................................................................... 43
   Limitations .................................................................................................................. 46

4. RESULTS .................................................................................................................... 48

5. DISCUSSION .............................................................................................................. 52
   Overview ..................................................................................................................... 52
   Findings ....................................................................................................................... 53
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tables</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Indicator amounts and Daly’s proportions of women studied</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Indicator percentages of total compared to Daly’s proportions of women studied</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Primary pathways by frequency</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1

Introduction

Since its advent in the early part of the 20th century, television has enraptured the American public as a primary medium for both information and entertainment. Television differs from many of its mass media predecessors in the sense that its message is comprehensive, including audio and second-to-second visual cues, and conveniently available to all (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 176). Television typically offers a dynamic narrative that overshadows its dramatically selective nature (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 178), resulting in a focus on the more 'interesting' aspects of any subject matter being presented as a complete scenario and implying realism. The images that may be manufactured or maintained by television portrayals in regards to crime, criminals, and justice has the potential to be particularly problematic, specifically if presented narratives do not match reality closely enough (Eschholz, Mallard & Flynn, 2004, p.163). As there are so few extant alternative mass outlets from which to refute false or sensationalized information, the widely-noted fascination with crime television (Soulliere, 2004, p. 215) could have significant impact on consumers' real-life interactions with the justice system.

In 1976, Gerbner and Gross hypothesized that television presented itself as a unique medium that ultimately had the capacity to alter its viewers’ perception of reality (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 174; Gerbner 1998, p.177), specifically because it was so pervasive both in terms of availability and sensory stimulus (Gerbner, 1998, p. 178). Gerbner's resulting Cultivation Theory suggests that the available nature of television as a medium would ultimately have a direct impact on the beliefs and perceptions of its
consumers, congruent with television narratives (Manganello & Fishbein, 2009, p.4).

Gerbner's work, which primarily addresses television violence, is a frequent basis for studies attempting to determine or understand the impact of television as a medium (Manganello & Fishbein, 2009, p.3).

The details of the most exciting and dramatic aspects of criminal justice have long been of interest to television consumers, as illustrated by the consistent popularity of programming that chronicles crime, criminals, and the justice system itself (Soulliere, 2004, p.215). Such topics have served as popular entertainment for Americans for at least as long as mass media has held any semblance of prominence, dating as far back as television's most direct predecessor, the radio (Cheatwood, 2009, p.32), as well as contemporary print media (Surette, 1998, p.28). There remains a dearth of concrete evidence as to why this may be the case; however, the potential impact of television based on its influence and accessibility has been the subject of much research and concern (Surette, 1998, p.28).

Among researchers and criminal justice professionals, there is concern that the distorted narrative of popular television may give consumers unrealistic or inappropriate expectations about the criminal justice system (Haney, 2009, p.690), particularly because many dramatic elements are conveyed as realistic (Eschholz, Mallard & Flynn, 2004). This becomes potentially problematic for justice professionals when considering that consumers will inevitably participate in the criminal justice system as voters and jurors, and by extension, play an active part in the development of procedural precedent with little or no actual relevant experience (Eschholz, Mallard & Flynn, 2004, p.164, Haney,
How the improperly derived opinions and attitudes of every potential voter or juror may affect policy and justice in reality, then, makes television portrayal of the system of necessary concern to criminal justice professionals.

Modern television reflects some interest in an increasingly important element of both the criminal justice system and criminological research: women as offenders. Recent criminological pursuits have followed the increase in the number of women under correctional supervision, which has risen dramatically since the mid-1990s (Salisbury & van Voorhis, 2009, p. 542). Two contemporary series, the Netflix-produced *Orange is the New Black* (2013-present) and the Australian drama *Wentworth* (2013-present), follow the challenges of modern women who have been incarcerated. Each of these programs implies a basis in reality of the prison experience for women. *Orange is the New Black* is inspired by and takes its name from the memoir of ex-convict Piper Kerman. *Wentworth*'s official website states that prison visits were conducted before and during production to research and “ensure that the stories and look of *Wentworth* are a genuine glimpse of the jail system today in terms of inmates’ behaviour, the language and prison protocols” (Wentworth.sohotv.com.au, 2013). These production and advertising circumstances function to confound the lines between information and entertainment, whether by design or coincidence.

A common thread in these television portrayals of convicted women is the use of flashback scenes to establish characters (usually an inmate, sometimes prison staff) and their disposition, including their life circumstances prior to becoming incarcerated. This approach appears to be an acknowledgment of a 'pathways' perspective, which suggests
that the paths to crime for women may differ significantly from the paths of men (Bloom, Owen, & Covington, 2004, p.37). The Pathways perspective, which involves incorporating a comprehensive approach toward understanding the lives of women in shaping their criminality, has identified several key factors in female criminality, including early life experiences and sexual abuse (Bloom, Owen & Covington, 2004, p.37). Such factors will typically represent female offenders' routes, or 'pathways' to criminal behavior, and may or may not be appropriately evident in modern television portrayals.

The degree and nature of the liberties taken by television content creators should be of concern. In other instances of crime-oriented television, the accuracy of certain elements of the criminal justice system has been cautiously lauded as useful in orienting the public toward baseline operations of the system (Souliere, 2004, p.229), thereby acting in a manner that is not necessarily as detrimental as previously suggested. This may be limited to specific portrayals and certain elements, and should be taken on an elemental basis, rather than one of comprehensive portrayal. Functioning under the assumption that the entertainment media exists as a primary outlet for criminal justice information to the public (Bennett, 2006, p. 97, Haney, 2009, p.690, Eschholz et al., 2004, p.164, Souliere, 2004, p.216), the content of that information should be studied in order to determine its utility (if any). The availability of television programming relevant to the female criminal experience has the potential to reflect the overarching themes of the Pathways perspective, and it is with that in mind that this study seeks an answer to the following question:
Can *Orange is the New Black* serve as an appropriate teaching tool for the Pathways theory?
Chapter 2

Literature Review

Television and Criminal Justice Reality

Studies have shown that fictional television portrayal may have a special capacity to cultivate attitudes and expectations in consumers about certain aspects of the criminal justice system. Citing the general trend of closely imitating reality (Eschholz, Mallard, & Flynn, 2004, p.162), embodied most often in the “ripped from the headlines” format (Mutz & Nir, 2010, p.201), concern for fictional narratives stems primarily from the impact of the imitation itself. The blurred lines of reality vs. fiction is a recurring theme in research regarding crime-oriented television and its effects (Eschholz et al., 2004; Kort-Butler & Hartshorn, 2011; Mutz & Nir, 2010).

Mutz and Nir's experiment compared viewers of specially selected episodes of *Law and Order* intended to represent the criminal justice system both positively and negatively in order to determine the potential for fictional television programs to affect viewers' attitudes (2010). Despite participants being aware of the fictional nature of their viewed episodes, the researchers found significant tendencies of sympathy or reservation toward the justice system, respective to the episodes participants had watched (Mutz & Nir, 2010, p.210). Their findings suggest that fictional television diverges from non-fictional television in several ways, including content, viewership and how it is processed by consumers. Further, they assume that based on this that fictional television viewers are more susceptible to alteration in attitude than their non-fiction viewing counterparts (Mutz & Nir, 2010, p.201).
The sensationalizing process (Eschholz et al., 2004, p.161) that takes place in order to make any program palatable to ratings that will keep it on the air is of great concern to extant research. As commercial and competitive interests are paramount in deciding content (Gaeta, 2010, p.536; Haney, 2009, p.693), the full scope of law enforcement duties is likely to be left out entirely or misrepresented. Reality shows, such as Dateline's *To Catch a Predator*, rely on law enforcement participation to add legitimacy to their entertainment value, but the need to appease producers may damage the credibility of proceedings when more mundane aspects of law enforcement work, such as large amounts of paperwork, are ignored (Gaeta, 2010, p.551). Heavily edited reality shows like *COPS* and *To Catch a Predator* have the opportunity to emphasize positive points of the criminal justice system (such as the timely and consistent restoration of order) and de-emphasizing negative aspects such as racial tensions or use of excessive force, while simultaneously being able to advertise their content as an accurate portrayal (Haney, 2009, p. 706). Meanwhile, the presentation of fictional programming as “realistic,” combined often with a loose basis in real-life sensational crime can help to blur the lines between fiction and reality concerning crime and how it is addressed (Eschholz et al., 2004, p.162) through “representational realism” (Dirikx, Van den Bulck, & Parmentier, 2012, p.39).

Societal fascination with crime is reflected in the sheer volume of crime-oriented programming available (Soulliere, 2004, p.215), but blurring of real-life portrayals and fictional portrayals may have some serious implications. Soulliere (2004) suggests that some of most popularly depicted roles in the justice system is that of the police, with
whom many television watchers will not have direct experience and are therefore likely
to rely on what they know from television (p.216). Law enforcement work is often
overly dramatized or romanticized in television depictions, typically through an
overemphasis on 'action' (Soulliere, 2004, p.225). A content analysis of the popular
fictional programs *Law and Order* and *NYPD Blue* undertaken by Eschholz, Mallard, &
Flynn (2004) has exposed the depiction of greatly exaggerated violent crime rates, and
greatly exaggerated violent crime clearance rates (Eschholz et al., 2004, p.172). Further,
murder was portrayed as prominent, accounting for 79% (*NYPD Blue*) and 92% (*Law &
Order*) of the crimes shown in one television season, as compared to the Uniform Crime
Report's reported rate of 0.22% (of all reported crimes in New York City, where both
shows are based) for the same year (Eschholz et. al., 2004, p.171).

Soulliere (2004), in a similar analysis of popular shows like *Law and Order*,
*NYPD Blue*, and *COPS* has concluded that, in some cases (both fictional and non-
fictional), portrayals of police work are fairly accurate, and could serve as a source of
“demystifying” police work for the public (p.229). In the analyzed programs, portrayals
were considered representative (based partly on statistics from the NYPD) of real-life
police work in terms of police composition by race/gender, police tasks and roles,
structure, and reactive response to crime, with Soulliere even considering such elements
as an appropriate baseline orientation to police work for viewers (2004, p.229). Soulliere
is careful, however, to note that other aspects of the presentation lacked the same
accuracy, including the overall success of the police, a disparity that was demonstrated
most clearly in crime clearance rates that were found to be exaggerated, consistent with similar research (Soulliere, 2004, p.228).

Dirikx, Van den Bulck, and Parmentier suggest that television is a primary way of storytelling in society, and that fictional police shows are important to producing the social meaning of police (2012, p.39). A content analysis of popular police-style shows that included *NCIS, The Mentalist* and *Without a Trace* concluded that more often than not, police are depicted as respecting procedural fairness, an assumed indicator of police morality (Dirikx et al., 2012, p.49). Nearly all instances in which this was not the case were related to 'getting the job done' or family-involvement bias, both representing understandable reasoning for ignoring procedural fairness, suggesting that fictional depictions of police serve as a primary means of reinforcing moral solidarity in American society (Dirikx et al., 2012, p.49). Though little mention is made in content analysis of how standardized narratives affect their viewers, patterns of respective over- and under-exaggeration in representation begin to become clear. As a purpose for crime television, creating the meaning of the role of the police may be supported by Tasker's (2012) work, which suggests that post-9/11, there has been an increase in story lines focusing on everyday police taking up the role of national security (p. 45). Pulling from popular programs such as *Bones, Lie To Me, Criminal Intent*, and *Law and Order* (none of which are focused primarily on matters of terrorism or national security), Tasker suggests that national security is being re-framed to not fall solely within the jurisdiction of special units and individuals (2012, p. 65).
Despite the assumed mutually beneficial relationship between the police and the media alluded to by Dowler (2003), in which the police have a vested interest in maintaining a respectable reputation through portrayal, and the media needing sources of crime information, it is difficult to tell exactly how the romanticized portrayals of police work affect the television viewing public's perception of the police. Dowler's findings when comparing media consumption to perceived police effectiveness suggest no significant link, and rather, attributes views of police effectiveness to other factors such as personal experience or conditions, such as living in high crime neighborhoods, or race (2003). Dirikx, Gelders, & Van den Bulck (2013), working under the assumption that police are generally portrayed positively in fiction and featured as primarily successful in the news (p.117), attempted to determine the disposition of Flemish adolescents regarding real-life police performance based on their exposure to television. No significant relationship was found between exposure to all available forms of crime television (reality, fiction, news) and perceptions of police performance, and instead found that recent negative experience with police had a larger effect (Dirikx, Gelders & Van den Bulck, 2013, p.126). The experience of Flemish youth, however, may not analogize well with American television viewers due to inherent sociocultural differences.

**The CSI Effect.** A more recent trend in crime-oriented television shows is their focus on the forensic science involved in solving crimes (Baskin & Sommers, 2010, p.97), resulting in a loosely-defined phenomenon known as the “CSI effect.” Generally, CSI effect refers to the assumed tendency of trial juries who have had exposure to CSI-
style programming to hold unrealistic expectations about forensic evidence (Hughes & Magers, 2007, p.259).

Kruse's (2010) content analysis of CSI cautions the reader to recognize that forensic science is incorrectly framed as the only legitimate source of evidence in trial proceedings. Subtle utilization of dialogue and imagery within CSI presents forensic evidence as not only the sole legitimate type of evidence, but further as infallible, creating a black and white environment that is recognized as nearly impossible in real-life science (Kruse, 2010, p.88). Kruse suggests that this presentation could easily create unrealistic expectations about forensic science's place in the criminal justice system, and that these images, given their fictional success, could translate to assumed knowledge when placed in the context of actual participation in the criminal justice system (2010, p.88).

In their multivariate analysis of over 1,000 jurors in Washtenaw County, Michigan, Kim, Barak, and Shelton (2009) found 'CSI'-style drama viewing to be related to expectations about scientific evidence. However, a significant effect was only found in scenarios involving circumstantial evidence as the only other type available (Kim et al., 2009). Exposure to CSI-style dramas was shown to raise the expectations of scientific evidence in cases with only circumstantial evidence, but no significant effect was found when considering exposure to television portrayals in cases of eyewitness testimony (Kim et al., 2009). In sum, expectations about scientific evidence may be heightened based on exposure, but it is not necessarily to the point of being the only sort of evidence that will bring about conviction. Generally, Kim and associates dismiss the prevalence of
Holmgren and Fordham (2011), as a result of their survey of Australian and Canadian viewers (populations often considered similar to Americans, and with comparable exposure to programming), are similarly unwilling to accept the existence of the CSI effect as it is commonly defined (p.S68). Instead, they suggest that while awareness of forensic evidence is increased it is not a preoccupation among potential jurors, though the potential for “important differences” between regular crime-show watchers and their non-watching counterparts is implied (Holmgren & Fordham, 2011, p.S68). Maeder and Corbett’s (2015) study of Canadian university students yielded similar results, suggesting no significant difference between levels of viewership, and instead led them to conclude that there may be an extant sympathy in viewers who perceive fictional television as realistically portrayed, but only minimally and indirectly (Maeder & Corbett, 2015, p. 102).

Baskin and Sommers (2010) contend that the CSI effect does exist, and that crime show viewing has a direct and independent effect on the disposition of jurors with regard to scientific evidence. Their survey of California registered voters regarding predispositions toward various forms of testimony found that scientific evidence was consistently ranked as the most reliable in the minds of respondents (Baskin & Sommers, 2010, p.107). While no link was found between views of evidence reliability and hypothetical willingness to convict, amount of crime show viewing (three or more hours per week) was shown to have a direct effect on the same hypothetical willingness. Respondents who had watched more crime shows thought that they would be less willing to convict when lacking scientific evidence (Baskin & Sommers, 2010, p.107). Mancini’s
(2013) study of eighty jurors in Western Pennsylvania (p.549) lends support to the existence of the CSI effect under limited conditions. Though the study was able to see a marginal difference between described 'light' and 'heavy' viewers of fictional crime television under certain delineated subtypes of the CSI effect, the difference with regard to consideration of evidence type was minimal (Mancini, 2013, p. 557).

Hughes and Magers' (2007) research on the proliferation of shows focusing on scientific evidence suggest that while these shows may or may not have an actual impact on jurors, the potential impact is being recognized and compensated for by actors within the criminal justice system. Since the advent of CSI-style programming, Kentucky circuit court judges are mixed on how this is affecting their administration of justice (Hughes & Magers, 2007, p.270). A majority of judge respondents had perceived changes in the ways juries are selected and defense presentation, but generally did not perceive the need to change their administration in any significant way, as they did not tend to perceive any impact on convictions (Hughes & Magers, 2007, p.270-271). Despite acknowledging that expectations of scientific evidence were heightened among jurors, no increase in the availability of scientific evidence was perceived by the judges (Hughes and Magers, 2007, p.270). The true extent of the CSI effect, if it exists at all beyond preemptive action, remains unclear. The CSI effect's ambiguity, however, provides a perfect example of the relationship between television and the criminal justice system in the sense that its precise influence is likely to remain unknown, but it is hardly able to be ignored entirely.

**Concerns and Effects.** Concern for the potential effects of television viewing is deeply rooted in the perception that the sensationalized views of a crime and crime-
handling will influence television watchers in their interactions with the justice system, primarily as jurors and voters with a skewed view of the system (Haney, 2009). The “infotainment” format described by Sacco as featuring as number of dramatic techniques common in television (as cited in Kort-Butler & Hartshorn, 2011, p. 39), posed as realistic, has the capacity to give viewers an incorrect, or out of context framework for handling life and death situations, such as in capital cases (Haney, 2009, p. 729, 691).

Punitive attitudes have been attributed more strongly to other factors such as race or education level while dismissing media consumption as irrelevant (Dowler, 2003). In other cases, favoring punishment options over rehabilitation options has been shown to have a direct link to increased exposure to media (Goidel, Freeman, & Procopio, 2006, p. 132; Rosenberger & Callanan, 2011, p. 447). Rosenberger and Callanan (2011) found their strongest correlation of media variables related to punitive attitudes in the form of television consumption, independent even of personal experiences. The lean away from support for rehabilitative processes may be a result of a television narrative that focuses on individuals to the effect of decontextualizing criminal behavior (Haney, 2009, p. 729) and misrepresenting crime, fueling support for incapacitation as a means of keeping communities safe (Rosenberger & Callanan, 2011, p. 447). Attitudes regarding punishment, or the effective functioning of the justice system in general, may also be influenced by the “mood” of the story being told in television drama, including how easily viewers can empathize with characters or situations, methods used, and portrayed effectiveness (Mutz & Nir, 2010, p. 211).
“Media criminology” (Haney, 2009, p.689) is of particular concern when taking into account how jurors might decide upon administration of the death penalty. Haney (2009, p.739) cautions that the extreme sensationalization of crime without broader context in the media may legitimize more punitive approaches to stopping crimes, including the death penalty. Kort-Butler and Hartshorn (2011) found support for the death penalty to be a result of increased exposure to crime drama (p.51). It is suggested that crime-oriented television not only may bolster support for extreme punitive approaches, but disseminates and maintains a view of crime that supports them (Kort-Butler & Hartshorn, 2011, p.51) and excludes any other approach (Haney, 2009, p.739).

The prevalence of criminal justice-oriented television may also influence the decision of college students to pursue criminal justice as a major. In attempting to determine whether students were making their major choices in criminal justice based on factual information about the field, Barthe, Leone, and Lateano (2013) surveyed 335 criminal justice undergraduates regarding the circumstances under which they entered the major, including measures to determine the level of television influence. Sixty-five percent of their sample were reported as admitting to being influenced by the television programs they enjoyed watching (Barthe, Leone, & Lateano, 2013, p. 19). Media influence also tended to predict the type of career that students reported being interested in, broken down into three program categories (fans of courts shows favored legal careers, for instance) (2013, p. 23). Through several measures, the authors saw a number of disparities in students' perceptions of the reality of the criminal justice field, and ultimately concluded that criminal justice as a discipline may have a special
responsibility to dispel the portrayals of television in order to give its students reasonable information about their available opportunities within the discipline (2013, p. 25).

Not all cases of the media's assumed misrepresentation of the criminal justice are to a necessarily detrimental effect. Guastaferro (2013) makes the case for 'good tv' as a pedagogical tool in academia (p. 270). Using the HBO show *The Wire* as an integral part of a media and crime course which also utilized lectures, activities, and discussions, Guastaferro attributes the success of the course to students' interest in the program itself (2013, p. 270). The ability to put the show in a larger scholarly context by including it in the course of an academic program allowed for critical discussion and what Guastaferro views as the creation of active consumers (2013, p.270). The implications of the success of the media and crime class are important in the sense that adding context (such as through ongoing discussion) is specifically alluded to by the author on numerous occasions, with an underlying assumption that, without context, the same information could be very misleading. Television may be viable in criminological/criminal justice pedagogy, but almost certainly must approached critically as opposed to casually.

Yar (2012) challenges criminological researchers to consider the context of emergent forms of media. Citing the wide availability of primarily social media sites, which offer affordable and widespread access to production of media. Yar suggests that even though the extent of the criminal justice system's relationship with the mass media is largely unknown, the inherent differences in new media platform may require an approach that is distinct from what is known about 'old' media (2012, p. 255). Though no particular approach is offered by Yar, the suggestion of taking a closer look at how new
technologies and platforms will affect the relationship between criminal justice and the media in certainly something to consider. Digital streaming services such as Amazon and Netflix offer a particular departure from the traditional delivery of television (Ellingsen, 2014, p. 106). Ellingsen suggests that the changing landscape of content delivery, including the flexibility and availability of content, has been contributing to the decline of traditional media (2014, p. 106). Should this prove the case in the long term, Yar would indeed seem correct in asserting that new approaches need to be explored.

Ultimately, all extant findings are limited by sample and scope, but each adds to cause of inquiry. Disparity in results promotes ambiguity in understanding the true extent, if any, of the effects of crime television watching on a public who will call for policy and serve as jurors. The impact of television portrayals, both fictional and otherwise, have some potentially serious implications, and further research is clearly needed.

**Portrayals of Prison and Prisoners**

The American fascination with crime and corrections as entertainment is fairly well-documented, and is cited frequently as having some effect, if even an unknown one, on American penal attitudes (Bennett, 2006; Haney, 2009; Mathieson, 2001; Novek, 2009; O'Sullivan, 2001). In instances in which no other source of knowledge (such as personal experience) is available, inundation with popular culture is thought to inform perceptions of reality (Gerbner, 1976; Mathieson, 2001, p.38). With regard to crime related elements of society, including prison, the closest many will ever personally get is through media portrayal (Bennett, 2006, p.97), and so these perceptions will hold gravity. Television, and by extension film for many of the same reasons, is considered a
particularly unique medium in the sense that it creates powerful imagery (Gerbner, 1976; Mauer, 2001), which offers a more “visual and emotional” impact (Mauer, 2001, p.17). Of concern, then, in cases of such gravity, is that various entertainment media are ultimately beholden to their ratings, or “commercial viability” (Mason, 2006, p.621), rather than realism for the sake of dramatic hold (Mauer, 2001, p.17). The result is a “reality” that does not necessarily reflect prison life, and is pervasive enough to establish context for those to whom it would not be otherwise available.

Formidable among concerns regarding media portrayals of prison life is the focus on and sensationalism of negative aspects, such as violence. In analyzing a sample of prison films released between 1995 and 2005, Mason finds an overwhelming theme of brutality in the prison film genre (2006, p.621), with few to no redeeming qualities portrayed. Citing frequent and prominent depictions of sexual assault and violence, he suggests ultimately that prison film medium serves to limit both the narrative on imprisonment and the meaning of it to little more than the brutality portrayed (Mason, 2006, p. 261). Sexual assault/abuse specifically, referred to by Man and Cronan as “one of America’s oldest, darkest, and yet most open secrets” (Man & Cronan, 2001, p.128), is well represented in prison entertainment media. While the use of tactics on the part of correctional officers to facilitate sexual assault as a part of the punishment in prison is suspected to be a matter of reality (Man & Cronan, 2001, p. 141), frequent and graphic portrayal of such assaults help to create the narrative that defines the meaning of incarceration. It is infrequent that depictions of incarceration involve daily and more common aspects of prison life, such as more benign interactions with guards or other
inmates (Collins, 2011, p.674), leaving only displays of brutality, primarily from other inmates. This helps to create the first part of the public image given by the media; the circumstance of incarceration.

The depiction of the prison in film and television is complementary to the depiction of prisoners in popular media. Commonly portrayed as the perpetrators “wicked” or “depraved” acts (Drake, 2011, p.380), little room is left for empathy from viewers. Mason suggests that it is little more than standard practice for media depictions (films, specifically) to construct prison inmates as “inhuman others,” who are deserving of whatever treatment they receive (Mason, 2006, p.621). Similarly, Haney (2009) finds that inundation with the fictional (and near-realistic) media, particularly in the form of television is nearly impossible to avoid. He refers to the media narrative on criminality as both consistent and “consistently problematic,” (2009, p.738), and suggests that it serves to do little more than decontextualize the criminal behavior and demonize those who engage in it (p.739). Further, in a majority of cases where negative portrayal of prisoners include a tendency toward redemption being reserved for the exceptional, viewers may have little option beyond an observable theme that they subject only to what they are a fairly due (O'Sullivan, 2001, p.321). Adding to the notion of deserving prisoners is the tendency in audiovisual media to depict the incarcerated as “irrefutably guilty,” which validates any negative treatment received (Hunt, 2007, p.73). The portrayal of prisoners as any sort of “other” that viewers should find difficulty empathizing with stands to fill out the second half of the full narrative of the prison genre, or the deserving being subject to adverse conditions. The combination of these two generalized elements of prison
portrayals in television and film form the “standardized, stereotypical manner” (Van den Bulck & Vandebosch, 2003, p.106) in which prison life is projected audiovisually to masses with no counter experience upon which to call.

Carrington (2015) uses a series of photographs taken during interviews with prisoners in Australia to demonstrate the overarching manipulation of the prisoner image by the common media. By specifically choosing angles and poses of prisoners, as well as doing things such as blurring tattoos, she displays images that more accurately match her accounts of the prisoners she spoke with (2015, p. 9). She suggests ultimately that generalized images of prisoners will tend to be oversimplified (p. 10) and does so primarily through her own image manufacturing process. This follows with a lack of context that tends to characterize common imagery of the incarcerated.

Mathieson, in analysis of “public space” (or public opinion) regarding crime and corrections, suggests that television offers a significant impact on public opinion, to the ultimate effect of encouraging prison growth (2001, p.39). Though this is not necessarily the focus of his work, and therefore he does little in the way of substantiating it, however, Novek's (2009) exploration helps a bit to fill in the gaps. Claiming that Americans suffer from an obsession with prison and prison culture, she suggests that it has become an integral part of our mass culture, citing the availability of famous prisons available as vacation itinerary items (Novek, 2009, p.382), as well as a great number of popular television shows that utilize prisons as their setting or for comic effect (p.378). The result of this obsession, Novek suggests, is that negative public attitudes are ultimately bolstered and legitimized by media inaccuracies, as the images have filled the vacuum
left by the increasing secrecy of penal institutions (2009, p.382) and that inundation with television tropes has given viewers an unfounded fear of crime (p.377), an undoubted furthering of the perceived need for the prison setting.

In exploring the actual effects of audiovisual imagery on people with little to no other experience regarding prison, Van den Bulck and Vandebosch (2003), sought the perception of first-time Belgian prisoners of their experience, with consideration to the fact that most media images regarding prison come out of the United States (p.108). Qualitative questioning revealed that many of the inmates, based on their intake of media primarily, had far more dismal expectations of prison, including the quality of food, indifference of staff, as well as a population composed primarily of violent criminals and initiations that would almost certainly involve rape (Van den Bulck & Vandebosch, 2003, p.108). It seems important to note that the expectations of prisoners who had incarcerated friends or prior experience with holding cells of juvenile detention expressed a far less shocked reaction to the disparity between media imagery and the reality of prison (Van den Bulck & Vandebosch, 2003, p.109), in clear support of the earlier assessment of realities created by the fictional media. Though this does not necessarily speak to how American would-be prisoners may see the same disparities, it would seem to speak volumes for the capacity of fictional portrayals to give expectations that may not be realized in real life for viewers in general. The uniform and powerful narrative, then, seems no less than pervasive.

Speaking on prison in general, Wright (2000) refers to it as an avenue of deterrence, in the sense that it is distant and unknown, but nevertheless looming over the
heads of would-be lawbreakers as a weapon of social control via cultural images of the of consistent harsh treatment and imminent danger (p.16). Popular images of prison life, as a result of their popularity, serve further to normalize the brutal treatment (Wright, 2000, p.16) viewed in popular imagery in order to bolster public acceptance and even encouragement (Novek, 2009, p.378). This lends to Wright's overall assertion that popular culture may serve the primary goal of defining societal norms rather than reflecting them (2000, 15).

The media is well noted for its capacity to construct social meaning in the public arena (Drake, 2011, p.367; Novek, 2009, p.378). The prison genre images, with the constructed dichotomy of the deserving prisoner and the brutal circumstance, serve the very important role, ultimately, of legitimizing prison as a form of punishment (O'Sullivan, 2001, p.330). The problem would seem largely agreed upon that the audiovisual narrative, as an integral part of popular culture, is succeeding in framing American mass imprisonment as an “acceptable social condition” (Wright, 2000, p.21).

The Women-in-prison Narrative. There would seem an unsurprising dearth of study regarding the common images of female prisoners outside of the context of prisons in general (most often referring to males). However, Ciasullo (2013) suggests that there is a common narrative in stories regarding women offenders. Looking primarily at books and films from the mid-20th century, Ciasullo asserts the existence of a common (if slightly variable) story line in which in an otherwise 'normal' new arrival will encounter a cast of standard characters, the most important of which being the aggressive prison lesbian (2013, p.197). She attributes the prevalence of this trope to a basis in early
research on female offenders which suggested the inversion of gender roles as a cause of prison homosexuality (2013, p. 199). In all, she argues that the common narrative of female prison fiction serves to depict the true lesbian as an 'other' figure, and ultimately reinforce heterosexual behavior in most female offenders (Ciasullo, 2013, p. 218).

**Women offenders and the Criminal Justice System**

**History.** A brief historical context for the study women offenders in the United States is offered by Belknap's (2010) analysis of articles regarding women offenders found in the Journal of Criminal Law and Criminology during its first century of publication. Belknap isolated nineteen articles published between 1910 and 1971 that fit the criteria for relevance to female offenders, including reformatory and offender characteristics, as well as the causes of criminality in women (2010, p. 1062). Belknap's analysis of the available research illuminates a number of historical trends regarding female offenders.

Looking at research reports in the early part of the 20th century, Belknap found that reported rates of incarcerated women were high in comparison to the present, even in light a widely-acknowledged dramatic increase in women under state supervision in recent decades (2010, p. 1068). She concludes, through a combination of her own analysis and the suggestions of her analyzed authors, that this may be attributable to a trend within the justice system at the time of policing the morality of women. Specifically, a significant number of their criminal infractions were relevant to consensual sex (adultery, prostitution, etc.), for which no comparable criminal sanctions stood for men engaged in similar behaviors (p. 1069). She further notes a significant and
relatively sudden decline in the incarceration rates of women around 1932 that appears to remain stable until the 1980s (p.1069).

Among the themes identified and explored in Belknap's account of historical research articles is the role of traumatic experience in the lives of female offenders. Though frequently overlooked by researchers in the sample, Belknap herself notes that the indicators frequently associated with generalized pathways theory are evident throughout her readings (2010, p. 1081). Though only one study in her sample openly acknowledged the importance of understanding the offenders' pasts as part of the research design, several included information regarding the previous conditions of their sampled offenders, including focus on the home lives of women as children, and prior to incarceration. She noted, however, that little was generally done to account for such conditions, and in some cases, inmates were even blamed for their adverse home life (2010, p.1081). Belknap concludes ultimately that the trends throughout her analysis remain consistent into the modern handling of female offenders. She suggests that historical approaches reflect the contemporary direction of women offenders' interactions with the criminal justice system in the sense that they are oriented toward biological explanation, and the system reacts in deficient and sexist manner (2010, p.1090)

Modern Circumstances and the Pathways Perspective. A common theme in modern research regarding female offenders and the criminal justice system is acknowledging that the experience of women differs drastically from that of their male counterparts, often while analyzing how policy and other social factors impact the disparate circumstances. This is coupled with the recognition that most widespread
theories of deviance were focused on the male experience, with little actual context for
the circumstances and needs of women (Chesney-Lind & Shelden, 2004, p.106). Modern
feminist criminology, then, seeks to determine both the place of women in male-centric
study, as well work toward explanations of female deviance that may be more appropriate

Bloom, Owen, & Covington (2004) refer primarily to a 'pathway perspective,'
which emphasizes the importance of recognizing gender as a factor in shaping
criminality, as well as addressing women's lives comprehensively to determine their
paths to state supervision (p. 37). The pathways perspective seems, at its base, generally
more oriented toward incorporating these principles, rather than codifying specific routes
to incarceration for women. Regardless, a number of grouping models have surfaced as a
result of pathways oriented research. Results have trended toward some common themes
in the life circumstances of women offenders, including disproportionate histories of
personal abuse, substance abuse, domestic violence, severe societal marginalization, and
tendencies toward destructive relationships, each of which is considered to have a
heightened risk for women due to their gender (Bloom, Owen, & Covington, 2004, p.37).

In attempting to codify pathway trajectories, Daly (1992) was able to identify five
distinct pathways of women accused of felonies in New Haven, Connecticut. Using what
she refers to as a “deep sample” method in which she was able to extrapolate
biographical information from presentence investigation reports (PSIs) and transcripts
from court proceedings, Daly compared the life circumstances of 40 men and 40 women
accused of similar felonies between 1981 and 1986 in the New Haven courts (1992,
Daly ultimately determined the presence of five generalized routes to conviction: “battered women,” who were or had recently been in relationships with violent men, “drug-connected women” who used or sold drugs in connection with family or significant others, “other women,” who showed no indicators of any other archetype, “street women, “who were either forced onto the streets by abusive households or drawn to the excitement of street life, and “harmed or harming women,” who are characterized generally by difficulty in their histories growing up and subsequent problems (1994, pp. 46-48). Daly noted a departure in her findings from what she calls the leading scenario (at the time) in which street women-types make up the majority of female offenders, finding instead a preponderance of women fitting her harmed and harming women archetype, possibly attributable to her study addressing only felony courts with little to no regard for misdemeanor offenses (Daly, 1992, p. 396).

Daly's overall findings suggested that harmed and harming women as well as street women were the dominant archetypes in her female sample at 37 percent and 25 percent, respectively, and each of the remaining ranging between 10 and 15 percent (1994, pp. 47-48). This may be attributable, as Daly herself suggests, to the strict inclusion of felony offenses, but may also be a result of Daly's broad definition of harmed and harming women that could easily overlap with other route archetypes. Daly is also careful to caution that her sample may not be reflective of the national population, noting that while New Haven shares a similar proportion of female defendants, racial breakdowns and convictions secured by plea bargain may differ drastically, as well as a higher overall rate of violent offenses (1994, p.25). Her professed goal is not necessarily
to reduce any given woman's experience to something so generalizable, and she suggests
that there is a range of life experience (1992, p. 391). Regardless, the New Haven Court
Study and subsequent analysis has delineated some specific trajectories that fit within
previously established themes of the female experience with the criminal justice system.

In a similar effort to identify women's pathways, Brennan, Breitenbach, Dieterich,
Salisbury, and Van Voorhis (2012) gathered criminal histories, assessments and
interviews from 718 female inmates who were considered 'soon-to-be-released' felons
from Valley State Prison for Women in California (p.1485). Drawing from previous
pathway research (including Daly's), they used criminal histories, assessments regarding
the risks and needs of each inmate, as well as an assessment for reentry readiness in an
interview process (Brennan et al., 2012, p. 1486), seemingly for the sake of the most
comprehensive information gathered while remaining practical in terms of time and
funding considerations. In all, they found that key elements of previous pathway models
were manifest in their derived framework, which included 4 larger categories, each with
two subgroups for a total of eight specified archetypes (2012, p. 1501). Breaking routes
down in a taxonomy style, the four main groups included “normal” women offenders,
battered women, poor subcultural socialized women offenders, and asocial aggressive
damaged offenders, which each subgroup referring to typical variations therein (p. 1499).
The categories, to a large extent, speak for themselves based on their labels, but
ultimately manifest adherence to common themes such as victimization and gendered
marginalization. The application of a quantitative method to what had previously been
approached qualitatively (pp. 1498-1499) further offers a departure from previous
research that expands upon and helps to validate common thinking with regard to female offenders.

Salisbury and Van Voorhis' (2009) study of female probationers in the Missouri Department Of Corrections sought to investigate the needs and circumstances of criminally involved women in terms of two generalized and overlapping perspectives: a pathways perspective (p.543), and a social and human capital perspective (p. 545). In attempting to statistically quantify the existence of certain common models suggested to be related to recidivism, Salisbury and Van Voorhis looked closely at criminal pathways that included childhood victimization, relationships, and social and human capital (or the ability to cultivate factors that might prevent criminality) (2009, pp. 546-547). Measures with regard to the sample's circumstances were taken from the intersection of several scales, many of which focused on various aspects of relationships, histories and self-efficacy (education/employment status) and such factors were compared to recidivism (Salisbury & Van Voorhis, 2009, pp. 550-553). The results of numerous bivariate analyses regarding the aforementioned scales led Salisbury and Van Voorhis to a number of conclusions, including the notion that a quantitative application of recurring qualitative themes such as relationship factors, mental illness and substance abuse is generally consistent with otherwise-known information regarding the gendered needs of women (2009, p. 560). Further, they suggest an indirect link between child abuse and repeat offending (Salisbury & Van Voorhis, 2009, p. 250). As their study was relevant only to women already involved with the criminal justice system, they made no offerings regarding women entering the system.
Similarly, in a study conducted by Winham et al. (2015) examining the relationships between childhood victimization, current adult attachments, psychological distress and substance abuse, was able to associate childhood victimization significantly with psychological distress (p.151). Utilizing interviews with a sample of 406 women on probation and parole in Jefferson County, Kentucky, many of whom reported childhood victimization, they applied several models to test various relationships between the aforementioned factors (Winham et al., 2015, p. 147). Childhood victimization was also found to have an impact on the relative insecurity of attachment in current relationships in at least two employed statistical tests (p.151). In seeking to determine the mediating effects of security of attachments, the investigators found that adult attachment was a significant factor in mediating the relationship between childhood victimization and psychological distress (p. 151), further suggesting that a focus on attachment may be a positive step for female-oriented programming (p.152). Though this particular study does not address a number of commonly recurring factors in the experience of women offenders, it works toward establishing important links between others.

DeHart, Lynch, Belknap, Dass-Brailsford, and Green (2014) investigated the role of traumatic experience and mental health in forging women's criminality. Using a mixed methods approach featuring qualitative interviews in supplement to statistics, the authors were able to evaluate a sample of 115 jailed women from four separate regions of the United States using a Life History Calendar (LHC)(p. 140). The LHC helped the investigators gain insight into each respondent's life timeline broken down by generalized age categories. Looking particularly at the effect of mental health, 50 percent of the
sample had met diagnostic criteria for a serious mental illness at some point in their life (p. 143), and these women showed elevated risk for the onset of substance use and drug offenses throughout each life stage, as well as an increased risk of running away from home in youthful life stages as compared to their counterparts not identified as suffering/having suffered from mental illness (p.147). The role of victimization in the women's histories in this study linked a number of factors to the onset of offending, as well as the type of offending. For instance, this study linked intimate partner violence with property crime, drug offending and sex work as well as associating caregiver violence with running away (p.148).

Johnson (2006) utilized the results of the women-specific section of Australia's Drug Use Careers of Offenders (DUCO) study to attempt to determine the co-occurrence of drug/alcohol dependency and mental illness in Australia's incarcerated women. Her analysis revealed a strong relationship between mental illness and drug dependency (as well as a lesser relationship with alcohol dependency), as well as a correlation with high-risk lifestyles such as participation in crime and sex work as a primary way of making a living (2006, p. 211). Johnson struggles a bit with the dilemma of causation in the relationship between drug dependency and mental illness, as the DUCO data does not suggest an order of occurring issues in its respondents, so whether one leads to the other (or they exist in an ongoing loop) is unknown (p. 212). Her findings, however, remain consistent with the otherwise known circumstances of female offenders, particularly as they may differ from males.
A study of female prisoners in Ohio by McDaniels-Wilson and Belknap (2008) supports the assumed prevalence of sexual victimization in the histories of female offenders (p. 1120). Sampling from all women's prisons in the state of Ohio, and utilizing primarily a modified Sexual Experiences Survey (SES) and the Sexual Abuse Checklist Survey (SACS) developed by McDaniels (McDaniels-Wilson & Belknap, 2008, p. 1102). In the sample of 391 imprisoned women, they found seventy percent self-reported a history of sexual abuses that would qualify as rapes or serious sexual assaults, with twenty-six percent reporting more than three separate abusers throughout their life (p. 1120). An important aspect of this particular study is the comparison used by the authors to preexisting samples of non-offending women, which suggests a significant difference in self-reporting of a wide range of sexual abuses that support the circumstance as a risk for female offending (p. 1121).

Though sexual abuse would seem a common form of the traumatic experiences of women offenders, 'trauma' as a generalized term would seem a common experience. Fuentes' (2014) study, which incorporated focus groups and life history interviews conducted in an urban North Carolina jail (p.88), suggests that interpersonal trauma may be one of the initial signs of a criminal trajectory in offending women (p.96). The trauma experienced by the women in the sample included witnessing crimes such as murder or assault, physical abuse, instability in childhood homes, as well as physical and sexual abuse, with the most common being some form of interpersonal violence (Fuentes, 2014, pp. 91-92). Though the author defines traumatic experience broadly, she acknowledges the role of traumatic experiences as a self-perpetuating one in women's life histories.
Fuentes suggests ultimately that throughout her respondents' lives, there is no one distinct factor that predicts criminality, but the preponderance of a variety of personal traumas that tend to begin in childhood and lead to others are a common theme (2014, p. 96).

In addressing the more generalized matter of public health, Freudenberg (2002) acknowledges common themes in the distinction between the experiences of men and women in the corrections system, including disproportionate histories of social and health problems (p. 1896). Studying the circumstances of short-term inmates released from jail in New York City, Freudenberg, Daniels, and Crum (2008) found that the women interviewed in their sample showed some stark differences from their male counterparts (p. S198). They attribute this primarily to the disparate needs of women re-entering society, and suggest ultimately that deficiencies in the quality and availability of drug treatment and mental health services would disproportionately affect the success of women inmates attempting to re-enter normal life (Freudenberg, Daniels, & Crum, 2008, p. S199). Women also showed significantly different priorities regarding successful re-entry, including a focus on housing and substance abuse (as opposed to men's picks of employment and education), suggesting that the obstacles to success may require a gendered approach (Freudenberg et al., 2008, p. S199). This study was limited by geographical location (taking places solely in one city), and the voluntary nature of its participants (Freudenberg et al., 2008, p. S200). As such, it may not be representative of the experience of all short-term prisoners nation-wide, and there may be differences in those who would choose not to participate.
Each case mentioned here is limited by scope, with many focusing only on a single state or jurisdiction. As well, many of these studies have been undertaken in the context of policy suggestion. A common limitation of research into the state of women in the criminal justice system and what brings them into it is the functional assumption that their experiences differ from those of men. Though the assumption is generally supported, many more recent studies would seem to overlook a direct comparison to the experiences of men entering the system. Regardless, the overarching themes of pathways research are generally consistent: childhood trauma, more general adult trauma, substance use and abuse, mental illness, and victimization of varied types. Though it is (and will remain) difficult to determine a true cause and effect scenario, the recurrence of common factors in extant research provides a solid baseline for the case of the special circumstances of female offenders.

**Theory**

A typical theoretical approach for content analysis is Gerbner’s Cultivation theory, which is described best as suggesting that exposure to television will positively (directly) impact beliefs and perceptions congruent with television narratives in its consumers (Manganello & Fishbein, 2009, p.4). In his studies of television violence, Gerbner developed a research approach (Cultivation Analysis) that accounted for this assumption and viewed television as a unique medium whose capability to alter beliefs and perceptions stemmed from several different qualities. His work is a frequent basis for media studies that seek to understand the impact of the medium (Manganello & Fishbein, 2009, p.3).
Gerbner suggested that television offered some very specific challenges to both its consumers and researchers. In the sense that television offered so many new and different elements as a mass medium, it would require a different approach than traditional research to determine its potential affects (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 174). “Cultivation Analysis,” as it is called, is intended as a complement to more traditional approaches to studying media effects, and features a combination of factors aimed directly toward determining the efficacy of television as a medium in creating social realities for its consumers (Gerbner, 1998, p. 191).

Gerbner begins with the general assertion that television is a medium that offers significant distinction from its mass media predecessors for several reasons (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 175). He and Gross compare its availability, for instance, to previous media, insisting that is does not require literacy (as print might), is free (unlike the cinema), does not require mobility (as other venues of entertainment or occupation such as concerts, church, etc.), and can “show as well as tell,” a distinction from its most popular and recent predecessor, the radio (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p.176). The ultimate distinction of television as a storytelling tool, in Gerbner's mind at least, is its scope in terms of how widely available it is, particularly with regard to its non-selective availability. Special interests, such as between categories of socioeconomic status, are not taken account, and instead create a widespread narrative of social reality (Gerbner & Gross, 1976, p. 177). Through this Gerbner frames television ultimately as a perhaps-unwitting and historically unrivaled tool of hegemony, one which cultivates a resistance to change through repetition of the status quo.
In Gerbner's estimation, a multi-pronged approach must be utilized when approaching the effects of television on viewers. The first prong (institutional process analysis, in which how the flow of mass media has policy applied) he seems to deem the least relevant to most studies of actual reality cultivation in viewership (Gerbner, 1998, p.179). The second and third prongs tend to be of more interest with regard to the impact of television. The second and third aspects of his approach are message system analysis and cultivation analysis (Gerbner, 1998, p.179) which attempt to measure narrative trends in television and the effect on viewers' perceptions of social reality, respectively.

Specifically, Gerbner seeks to understand whether television offers any real-life perception of the social world independently of other factors, and splits consumers into tiers based on the amount watched (Gerbner, 1998, p. 180). Acknowledging the complex relationship between the social mainstream and television's impact, he suggests that the relationship is, in fact, a dynamic one, in which common narratives may reflect mainstream sensibilities but are equally susceptible to shifts in that same common sentiment (1998). In short, any discernible impact of levels of television viewing may inform the continued viewing of the same consumers.

Cognitive psychology research has documented the superior efficacy of visual stimulus from television in children, but very few studies have investigated the effects of audio versus visual stimuli in adults (Hale, 2009, p. 276). Hale (2009) suggests that the noted effect of visual superiority may be attributable to the limited linguistic capabilities of children and may therefore not be replicated in adults (p. 277). Measuring informational retention in young adults using an instructional tennis video, Hale found no
significant manifestation of visual superiority, and rather suggests that auditory cues are more effective in adults (2009, p. 281). Though it is not directly related to matters of criminal justice, the lack of significant difference in audio or visual indicators in a controlled setting could speak to the validity of Cultivation Theory, or (as Hale suggests) emphasize the importance of the combined audio and visual effects of mediums like television (2009, p. 282).

**Measurement**

Maltz and Mullany (2000) described the challenges faced by social science researchers. Foremost among these challenges is that observation within social science is of people and behaviors, which differ in their adherence to the 'laws' found in natural sciences. For instance, people do not react as predictably as plants or molecules in test conditions. As a result, variables are typically simplified and limited to those that are most common or relevant. Person-based, or idiographic, approaches are more accurate for describing individual situations. Simplified approaches such as coding recurring variables may be necessary to gather data that is sufficient for statistical analysis rather than diversified to the point of obscurity (Maltz & Mullany, 2000, p. 258).

Research within the Pathways theory is difficult to quantify, due primarily to the heavily personal and qualitative nature of the Pathways approach (Salisbury & Van Voorhis, 2009, p. 542). Salisbury and Van Voorhis (2009) attempted to find statistically significant results through use of the recurrent factors in extant Pathways research, while acknowledging that their study (described previously) accounted only for the most prevalent themes to date (p. 543). Through the use of several scales deemed relevant to
the hypothesized factors of addiction, depression/anxiety and experiences of childhood abuse, Salisbury and Van Voorhis were able to conclude definitively that there is a link between the aforementioned factors and recidivism among female offenders (2009, p. 555). This study draws heavily from the themes derived from previous research on the Pathways theory to offer statistically credible support to an overwhelmingly qualitative paradigm.

Outside of criminology, similar methods have been utilized to categorize information that is fluid and idiosyncratic in order to create data sets that are more functional for statistical analysis. Van Leuven, Heinrich, and Deprez (2015) attempted to determine how, and to what extent, traditional media news providers in Belgium were utilizing less-traditional sources (such as social media) for foreign reporting on the events of the Arab Spring. In order to analyze 1121 selected news sources through quantitative content analysis, Van Leuven et al. categorized news articles into two primary and easily-defined groups of “mainstream” and “non-mainstream” sources from a more diverse categorization (Van Leuven et al., 2015, p. 579), allowing them to easily summarize media sourcing. Through broad coding of a diverse data set, they were able to state that social media and other less-traditional news sources were playing an important role in foreign reporting of the Arab Spring (Van Leuven et al., 2015, p. 587).

The studies herein have briefly addressed the complexities of social research, as well as an adaptive approach to reconciling quantitative analysis with qualitative data. Research within the Pathways paradigm focuses on the biographical circumstances of women when determining their relationship with crime, an almost exclusively qualitative
approach. While this is informative of individual situations, it is easy for large amounts of idiographic information to become unwieldy. In order to manage diverse information such as the life experiences of women in a way that is empirically meaningful, categorizations must be simplified, as they frequently are in pathway frameworks such as Daly's (described previously).

Summary

There is a clear lack of specific research on how women offenders are portrayed in the media. As such, this review has focused on the intersecting topics of crime and justice oriented television in general, the nature and function of mass media prison portrayals, and female offenders with regard to the pathways perspective of feminist criminological research. This review has pulled research from a number of disciplines, including criminology, media studies, popular culture studies, psychology, and anthropology. The breadth of disciplines concerned, even in part, with television's impact on society illustrates one of the most important themes evident herein: the pervasiveness and complexity of the issue. Specific phenomena such as the CSI effect can be operationalized and tested, but even in the case of the most straightforward examples, wide disparities are evident, speaking to the ambiguity of television's impact as a whole.

Most research focuses on establishing the potential for television portrayals to create social meanings or reality, often by comparing said portrayals to actual statistics, or testing the actual impact on consumers in what could only ever be imperfect testing. Research regarding prison as it is portrayed on television seems almost entirely focused on what meaning mass outlets create and how narratives legitimize the power of
incarceration. It would be nearly impossible to discover the true impact of television on American society because, as the research implies, there are generally too many factors involved in any given subject's disposition to know which is the most effective. However, there seems at least some agreement that how crime and justice are portrayed is something that should be consciously in the minds of criminal justice practitioners, whether it beneficial or detrimental. It is frequently acknowledged that the bulk of consumers will have television portrayals of crime and the criminal justice system as a primary source of information on those subjects, therefore the understanding of the complex relationship between the television media and criminal justice system must be critical.

The lack of research dedicated to how women are portrayed on television is likely a result of the parallel trend in research regarding women offenders. The development of specific approaches to studying women in crime is relatively recent, and it stands to reason that prior to any widely-recognized differences, the circumstances of women offenders were considered analogous to those of men. More recent research demonstrates distinct problems, such as childhood trauma and interpersonal violence that disproportionately affect women, and have likely called the media's attention as a source of entertainment. It is only recently that portrayals of women have gained any prominence.

In large part, extant research outlines television's potential impact on practitioners and students of criminal justice, leaving a large gray area. As well, women offenders are new to the television scene, likely based on their being relatively new to the research
scene as they compare to men. In general, each case must be taken individually and
mined for content that can be useful or detrimental. Taking the potential of television as a
possibility for teaching, appropriate representations of female offenders in new
programming would offer a glimpse into the circumstances of women interacting with the
criminal justice system.
Chapter 3

Methods

Study Design

This study used a qualitative and exploratory design that was coded quantitatively in order to address the research question of whether the television program *OITNB* can serve as a teaching tool for the Pathways theory. The purpose of this study was to determine whether certain elements of the program, particularly the portrayal of characters’ pathways to incarceration, are suited for use as an educational tool in helping students learn the well-known criminological theory. *OITNB*’s representation of a Pathways approach was determined by the presence or absence of audio and visual pathway indicators throughout one season of the show. This study used simplified indicators in order to quantify the thematic findings a criminological perspective in which qualitative research is abundant. This study followed the example of Salisbury and Van Voorhis (2009) which used the prominent categorical themes found in existing Pathways research as factors that can be measured numerically. Whereas analysis within the Pathways model is typically undertaken to explore factors in female criminality, this study assumed the validity of common findings in order to create acceptable categories for analysis within *OITNB*.

Subjects

With regard to the research question, *OITNB* was selected for analysis based on its popularity, availability via the streaming service Netflix, and relevance to the subject matter. The show’s format was well-suited for measurement of the Pathways theory, as
each episode features a 'focus character,' typically implied by the presence of flashback scenes that offer information about the character's life prior to their arrival in prison. Episodes were selected purposively by the researcher in a preliminary viewing of all extant episodes of *OITNB*. The first season was selected based on its tendency to focus on the ‘main’ characters as determined by billing order of the actors, as well as its adherence to the format of focusing primarily on one character per episode. Each episode was initially intended to function as its own unit of analysis, however, looking at one season only would have resulted in a sample of only 13. In order to acquire a larger sample without compromising the narrative continuity for raters, each episode was bisected for analysis, resulting in 26 segments (n=26) from 13 total episodes. The run time of each episode (including opening and post credits) in season one was taken from Netflix, at which point the time was divided in two and rounded up to the nearest minute. In instances in which the run time was an odd number of minutes, the first half of the episode received the extra time. This was the case in five of 13 episodes. Episodes in season one ranged from 51 to 60 minutes, and segments ranged from 26 to 30 minutes.

**Measures**

Daly's pathways model was selected for the instrumental approach due to its relative simplicity as it compares to other available Pathways models. Daly's outline features five Pathway archetypes, which include: Street Women, Harmed and Harming Women, Battered Women, Drug-Connected Women, and Other Women (Daly, 1994, pp. 47-48). A worksheet was created in Google Drive that included the descriptive indicators for each delineated pathway (see Appendix A), and each line included Daly's exact
abridged wording. Check boxes and additional spaces were included for marking each observed indicator as “audio,” “visual,” or “both.” The worksheet was created for universal use with each analyzed segment. A set of step-by-step instructions (see Appendix B) was created to accompany the worksheets and included a list of the 'focus character' for each segment in the sample, with the exception of segments 13.1 and 13.2, which had no determinable focus character. Both the worksheets and the instructions were designed deliberately to require very little foreknowledge of the Pathways theory. Neither segment worksheets nor the worksheet instructions included the pathway match for each indicator, and this information was included in a key available only to the investigator (see Appendix C).

**Procedure**

Five raters were recruited via a Facebook post that asked for volunteers and outlined the requirements for participation (described below). Potential volunteers were asked to send a direct text message or private message to express interest. This process was also open to 'friends of friends' and other interested parties. Volunteers were retained based on their willingness and availability to undergo a brief, pre-determined training session related to recognizing signs of pathways in audiovisual media, as well as their willingness to commit to a two week time frame of viewing season one of *OITNB*. The only requirements regarding volunteers' familiarity with the program was a basic understanding of its premise and potential content, as this particular familiarity was taken to imply comfort with potentially graphic or otherwise traumatic content. Raters were
selected within one week of the initial posting, and the first five respondents who met the participation criteria were taken as the raters.

Training took place with all raters present and lasted approximately three hours. This training took place on a Saturday afternoon at the apartment of one of the raters who had volunteered her home. Raters were first given access to their materials: a copy of worksheet instructions, two copies of the segment worksheets, a clipboard, and a purple pen. The basic premise of the Pathways approach was briefly explained to the raters. Raters were then introduced to Daly's Pathway indicators as they appear on the worksheets. Pre-viewing discussion took for approximately 30 minutes to explain the instructions, which included: recognizing incidences of the specific circumstances listed within the context of basic Pathways indicators, the qualifications for determining audio and visual indicators, as well as recognizing and appropriately marking instances of simultaneous audio and visual cues. Raters were particularly concerned with recognizing indicators number two and ten ("petty hustles" and "unable to cope with current situation"), due to their potentially broad application. Roughly 15 minutes of pre-viewing discussion was used to come to a more stable consensus of what would represent appropriate demonstrations of indicators two and ten in the context of Daly's Pathway indicators and the greater Pathways approach.

After a final call for questions or clarifying questions, raters were given the name of a focus character and then watched, as a group, one segment (one half episode, 24 minutes) of the similar Australian television show Wentworth. During the practice segment they were allowed to collaborate and discuss the show segment to determine
which indicators were identified, as well as ask questions. During such discussions, the episode was usually paused, typically for not longer than one minute. Episode worksheets were used during this mock process to acclimate raters to the worksheet and the instructions. Discussion followed after viewing the show segment for approximately 30 minutes in order to understand and reconcile any disparities in observation. Raters were also given the opportunity to ask questions about specific incidences or application of the instructions.

Raters were then instructed to watch the second half of the episode (24 minutes) and were asked to follow the coding directions without collaboration, holding questions until the end of the segment. Once the segment had finished, approximately 30 minutes were dedicated to comparing worksheets and discussing responses as a group in order to find out what scenarios were (and were not) being counted, reconcile counting disparities within the group, and make sure that everyone had a sufficient understanding of both the indicators and the coding instructions. Some ambiguity remained regarding indicators two and ten, and 10 minutes were taken to reiterate the criminological context of the otherwise-vague indicators. Raters were given the opportunity to ask questions during all discussion periods.

At the end of the 180-minute training session, 26 worksheets were distributed to each rater, with instructions to watch the first season of *OITNB* and to use one worksheet per episode segment. Raters also received a fresh copy of the instructions of how to complete the worksheets. Raters were allowed to view episodes in any order and at their leisure, and were given two weeks to complete the season. Instructions included a
delineation of the focus character of each episode, as determined by the presence of scenes which establish the character’s life prior to becoming incarcerated. The final episode of the season (episode 13, segments 13.1 and 13.2) had no focus character, and raters were instructed to mark any instance they observed in any character for that episode only. Raters were instructed to look for the pre-determined and discussed Pathway indicators of the focus character in each episode, and mark the boxes or spaces next to the observed scenario, along with indicating whether the observed cue fell into the audio or visual category, as they had done in in the training session. Space was provided on each worksheet for additional instances beyond the first for each given scenario.

After two weeks, the worksheets were collected from the raters and were compiled into groups by episode (all worksheets related to episode 1:1, 1:2, etc.). Each rater's marks were then entered into an OpenOffice spreadsheet for analysis to determine the presence of Pathway representation within the sample. Inter-reliability was computed using Cronbach's Alpha and calculated at 0.61. This is generally considered low and in some cases unacceptable, though there is no universal minimally acceptable reliability value (Bonett & Wright, 2015, p.4). As a consequence, this study's findings must be interpreted with caution.

Limitations

The primary limitations of this study are the relatively short time spent training content raters, and the attempt to simplify an in-depth and diverse theoretical approach (pathways) into succinct, limited categories. Raters were trained in only one session on one day, and required no special qualifications beyond availability and willingness.
Though discussion and questions were offered during the training session, little of it was utilized by raters to gain clarity on the subject matter, and more was dedicated to gaining clarity on the instructions, as well as getting a feel for consensus among the group. In order to reduce confusion post-training, all raters were included in a group chat on Facebook that continued for questions up until the time that worksheets were collected.

The minimalism applied to the Pathways perspective in this study may also serve as a limitation in determining the pedagogical value of *OITNB’s* first season. Since the generalized Pathways perspective is a very diverse and often malleable approach that is heavily focused on in-depth analysis of individuals, attempting to reduce any given character to a list of simple demonstrated traits or actions may miss a wealth of information that might otherwise be relevant. Daly’s categories were selected specifically because they are simple, broad, and thematically similar to a large portion of Pathways research. These traits are important because raters were not expected to be well-versed in either feminist criminology or the impact of audiovisual media. As well, the exploratory nature of the study allows for simple identification of common, broad factors as a primary indicator of the necessity for more in-depth analysis.
Chapter 4

Results

Throughout 26 analyzed units (half-episodes), 62 audio and visual instances of pathway indicators were observed, with a mean of 2.38 indicators per unit. The Pathway types observed were Street Women, Harmed and Harming Women, Battered Women, Drug-Connected Women, and Other Women as delineated by Daly (1994, pp. 47-48). The inter-rater reliability of the five raters was calculated at 0.61 using Cronbach's Alpha.

The noted indicators showed some consistency with Daly's proposed breakdown of felonious female offenders; Street Women and Harmed and Harming Women remained the most prominent by a wide margin. Of the least-occurring three pathways outlined by Daly, Battered Women were overlooked almost entirely in the first season of OITNB, and Other Women were the third most represented, while they were the least common in Daly's findings. Tables 1 and 2 illustrate side by side comparisons of Daly's findings and indicators found in OITNB in the assessable sample of season 1 by amount and percentage respectively.

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator amounts and Daly's proportions of women studied</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daly</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. The data on Daly's numbers are taken from Gender, Crime, and Punishment, by K.
Table 2

Indicator percentages of total compared to Daly's proportions of women studied

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pathway</th>
<th>Street</th>
<th>Harmed and Harming</th>
<th>Battered</th>
<th>Drug-Connected</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicators</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>1.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daly</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.37</td>
<td>0.12</td>
<td>0.15</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note. The data on Daly's numbers are taken from *Gender, Crime, and Punishment*, by K. Daly, 1994 New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Each half-episode unit (N=26) was assigned a 'primary pathway' based on which of Daly's Pathway archetypes manifested in audio or visual indicators most frequently. Per unit, the primary pathways differed from Daly's proportions to the most drastic effects of Harmed and Harming Women occurring twice as often as Street Women, and Drug-Connected Women occurring more than twice as often Other Women. A primary pathway was similarly assigned to each full episode (two conjoined units representing one episodic story, N=12). When breaking primary pathways down in this way, Harmed and Harming Women occurred as often as Street Women, and Drug-Connected Women and Other Women occurred as often as each other. The Battered Women archetype was not represented at all. Table 2 shows the frequencies of primary portrayed pathways when taken in terms of single unit or full episode. In both instances, the breakdowns of primary pathways throughout the first season of *OITNB* show some deviation from Daly's original proportions. Particularly, the prevalence of Street Women, Harmed and Harming
Women, and Other Women may be over-exaggerated while occurrences of Battered Women are drastically downplayed. The specific frequencies of primary assigned pathways are illustrated in Table 3.

Table 3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pathway</th>
<th>Street</th>
<th>Harmed and Harming</th>
<th>Battered</th>
<th>Drug-Connected</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>By Unit</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By Episode</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daly</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The total by unit would otherwise be 26, however, two half-episode units were assigned two primary pathways.

Season one of *OITNB* had a total of 37.2 observed audio indicators (heard in dialogue) and 24.8 visual indicators (implied by visible scenarios). Audio indicators were consistently more prevalent than visual indicators throughout the season. In all, there were 20% more recognized audio indicators than visual indicators. Audio indicators were more prevalent than visual indicators in every case except one. Battered Women were better represented in visual indicators than audio, despite being the least represented overall of all of Daly's archetypes.
Overall indicators were split by 48% and 52% occurring in the first and second half of the season, respectively. When split by first and second half of each episode, the first halves contained 46% of the observed indicators, and the second halves contained 54%. There was a slight tendency for indicators to occur nearer to the end of each given full episode, and nearer to the end of the season.
Chapter 5

Discussion

Overview

Television programming that focuses on crime and justice for entertainment has potentially serious implications for the criminal justice system. If it can be assumed, as research suggests, that crime-oriented television plays a part in shaping the real-life views of its consumers, then their inevitable encounters with the criminal justice system are of necessary concern to the actors within it. Though the impact of television programming on the public remains nebulous, and subject to a combination of factors, the understanding of the potential impact is a useful tool in comprehending the criminal justice system in both the practical and theoretical sense.

Utilizing the general principles of Gerbner's Cultivation Theory, which suggests that television exposure will impact the beliefs and attitudes of its viewers, this study sought to determine whether the television show Orange is the New Black (OITNB) could be used as an educational tool for feminist criminology. The Pathways theory of criminology, and Daly's work specifically, was used in this study as a basis for determining the presence of notable elements within OITNB. Though research within the Pathways paradigm typically employs descriptive qualitative methodology, this study used a quantitative approach to content analysis to verify the existence of pathway markers within OITNB as the exploratory step in determining its pedagogical utility.
Findings

With consideration to the low (if not unacceptable) level of inter-rater reliability, and a lack of statistically significant findings within this study, the question of whether *OITBN* can be used as an effective teaching tool for the Pathways theory cannot yet be answered conclusively. The data collected, however, was revealing from a descriptive standpoint. The first season of *OITNB*, taken on an episodic basis, demonstrates not only the markers of common pathways, but also some proportional adherence to Daly's (1994) Pathway model.

Half-episode segments averaged 2.38 audio or visual scenarios indicative of at least one of Daly's Pathway archetypes (4.77 for full episodes throughout the season), suggesting that while the representation of characters' lives leading up to prison may not be the primary goal of the show, it is a consistent element in the storytelling process. Though the narrative of *OITNB* specifically follows the lives of women in prison, the inclusion of biographical vignettes (flashback scenes and dialogue) interspersed throughout the main narrative indicates some recognition of the critical part that personal history plays in the experience of women convicts. In short, while the common indicators of women's circumstances leading to crime were not found in abundance, they were not absent either.

Of Daly's pathways that were observed within *OITNB*, the proportions in which they occurred were encouraging. In Daly's (1994) findings, the majority of women fell into one of two generalized categories (“harmed and harming women” and “street women”) of description related to their histories and their crimes. The majority of
analyzed segments similarly fell into these two categories, per their primary pathway assignments. This is likely due to these categories being the most broad of Daly's classifications. Category three ("battered women") was drastically underrepresented, though this is possibly attributable to an overlap with category one, in which the harmed/harming aspect would take dramatic precedence for storytelling purposes. Category four (drug-connected women") was slightly underrepresented, while category five ("other women") was somewhat overrepresented. The over-representation of "other women" is assumed to stem from its inclusiveness as a sort of 'catch-all' category for those who do not fit well enough into any of the others. In touching on the major themes presented in Daly's research, *OITNB* has also covered (if minimally) the prevailing themes of criminological research relevant to women in general, including general histories of abuse or personal trauma (DeHart, Lynch, Belknap, Dass-Brailsford, & Green, 2014; Salisbury & Van Voorhis, 2009; Winham, 2015), substance use and abuse (Johnson, 2006; Winham, 2015), mental health concerns (DeHart et al., 2014) and sexual victimization/trauma (Freudenberg et al., 2008; McDaniels-Wilson & Belknap, 2008).

Despite the narrative liberties taken with Daly's archetypes and the broader themes they represent, *OITNB* would seem to demonstrate some obvious regard for the circumstances of women's real life criminality.

Misrepresentation is generally expected in fictional television, even where elements of truth are advertised, and the "blurred lines" approach is very common in justice-oriented fiction due to its popularity (Mutz & Nir, 2010, p.201). This is considered an almost necessary side effect of content creators prioritizing attention to
entertainment and ratings rather than absolute (and often dull) truth (Haney, 2009, p.693), and as a result some disparity is to be expected when programming is sensationalized for the purpose of entertainment (Eschholz et al., 2004, p.161). Whereas many studies regarding crime and justice in the media are concerned with the potential negative effects of extant disparity (Haney, 2009; Kruse, 2010; Rosenberger & Callanan, 2011), this study has been concerned with the available truth and its positive utility. *OITNB* undeniably portrays some aspects of the specific circumstances of women's criminality, but the extent to which its portrayals can be useful should be considered subject to further research.

**Implications for Theory Building**

The observations in this study seem to support the notion that the medium of television does add to the informative experience of its consumers. Of the total Pathway indicators observed, 60 percent of them were considered audio, with the remaining 40 percent considered visual. These numbers do not account for overlap (in which a scene in *OITNB* was counted as both audio and visual indicators for the same pathway). Further, the noted indicators do not, and cannot, account for factors such as tone and inflection in dialogue, background environment in visual aspects, as well as dramatic timing and sound effects including music. What this would seem to indicate, then, is that the stories of the characters are hardly limited to their dialogue. Rather, a sizable portion of their stories is portrayed less directly, through means both observable and abstract.
Regardless of certain storytelling aspects being outside of the scope of this study, the presence of both audio and visual indicators suggest an informative storytelling medium that is not fully able to be captured by either alone.

Previous research has suggested that the efficacy of either audio or visual components within television could be related to factors beyond the content itself. For instance, Hale (2009) suggests that visual cues may be more effective in information retention in children, while audio cues are more effective with adults (p. 281). It is unsurprising, then, to find a preponderance of audio indicators in a program aimed at an adult audience, with visual indicators serving as supplementary.

**Limitations and Implications for Research**

This study was designed to determine whether *OITNB* had any potential as a teaching tool within criminal justice or criminology academia. The results imply the availability of useful information. Whether by design or coincidence, the first season of *OITNB* represented several scenarios that aligned themselves well with the Pathways perspective of criminology. The implication is that while this exploratory study was unable to answer the research question conclusively, a clear case can be made for further research.

The lack of significant findings in this study likely indicates that the initial design was perhaps too simplified for an exploratory study. The consolidation of archetypes into traits that could be easily codified and counted undoubtedly failed to account for a wealth of relevant idiographic information regarding the characters (women) represented within
*OITNB.* Though some telling signs of common pathways were evident, getting a comprehensive view of each character was hindered by assuming their biographical information was to be found primarily within their focused episode. Rather, the narrative of each character occurred subtly throughout the season, and dialogue and scenes related to non-focus characters were frequently present. As the design of this study necessarily precluded observance of the indicators of any character not pre-designated as the focus in each episode, any future attempts at measuring the representation of pathway traits in *OITNB* should focus on the characters as the unit of analysis rather than each episode. Following a character's entire story arc as opposed to just the sections in which they are the most prominent would almost certainly glean better insight to the totality of their lives and situations, and therefore align itself better with a more traditional approach to the Pathways perspective.

Future research within this area should also consider the use of coders who are more familiar with the principles of feminist criminology and the Pathways theory specifically. This could be accomplished through more thorough training, or the selection of raters who are credentialed in the applicable fields. In this particular study the time and availability of coders was limited, as it was voluntary. Coders who are better versed in the telling signs of women's experience with the criminal justice system could be better prepared to recognize such signs within a medium that is not immediately focused upon them. Specifically because the factors within women's experience can be subtle and diverse, a more comprehensive understanding of their context would be well suited to identifying them.
**Implications for Practice**

The results of this study begin to show the potential for practical application, particularly in the realm of Criminal Justice pedagogy. As elements of a Pathways perspective are evident within *OITNB*, its use as a teaching tool is still a possibility with the correct approach. A critical context could easily be applied to make *OITNB* or similar programming viable for use within classrooms, particularly combined with commentary and discussion in an academic setting. This technique has been cited as useful in holding student interest and granting the ability to add context to valid information regarding the criminal justice system, specifically where it is otherwise feared to be misleading such as in fictional television (Guastaferro, 2013, p. 270).

Teaching through popular entertainment mediums, such as television, is both potentially beneficial and relevant to modern pedagogy. If it can be assumed, as prior research suggests, that crime and justice oriented stories are (and will remain) a popular staple of fictional media, then there is no allowable ignorance of their content. However, successful contextualizing of said content may be able to partially reconcile the disparate priorities of media producers and criminal justice professionals by giving students an appropriate and critical view of what is seen on television.
Appendix A

Unit Worksheet

Coder ID: ________________
Unit: _______________
Focus Character: _________________________

Indicators:

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Pushed out or ran away from an abusive household</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Petty hustles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Drug-addicted and engaged in prostitution</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Selling drugs to support drug habit</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Record of arrest/occasional incarceration</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Abused or neglected as a child</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Identified as a “problem child”/acts out</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Violent when drinking alcohol</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>May be drug-addicted and have psychological problems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Unable to cope with current situation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>In a relationship with a violent man/partner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Recently ended a relationship with a violent man/partner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Use or sells drugs in connection with a boyfriend or family members</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>Immediate economic circumstances/greed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B

Segment identification:

Instructions

Each half-episode is to be treated as one unit for purposes of worksheets. In the “Coder ID” section, write your name on each worksheet.

In the “Unit” section of each worksheet, indicate the unit identification by it’s episode number and section of the episode in number form. For an example, the second half of the 4th episode should be listed as 4.2

In the “Focus Character” section, fill in the name of the pre-identified inmate for each episode. This is available on your “Featured Characters” List (found on the back of these instructions)

Example: “Coder ID: Jimi Hendrix
Unit: __4.2___
Focus Character: Janis Joplin”

Observations:

-First, each viewer should familiarize themselves with the list of 14 circumstances listed on each segment worksheet (they are the same for each segment).

-While watching each episode, pay attention to the focus character and use a check or an X in the box to the left for each circumstance that is apparent for that character. The focus character is typically implied by the presence of flashback scenes related to that character’s history.

-For each viewed circumstance, indicate whether the implication was audio (heard through dialogue), visual (viewed with or without dialogue), or both. Use check marks or an X in the given space. Two checkboxes appear next to each listed circumstance, in columns marked “A” and “V.” The “A” column should be checked if the indication is audio, as described above. The “V” column should be checked if the indication is visual, as described above. Both boxes can and should be checked if the indicator was both audio and visual, as described above.

-There are three blank lines to the right of each listed circumstance, for each viewed scenario beyond the first of a given circumstance, indicate on one of the blank lines that it was viewed by filling in “A” for an audio indicator, “V” for a visual indicator, or “B” for both.

Applicable circumstances do not need to be limited to flashback scenes, but should be limited to scenes which provide indicators regarding the focus character of any given segment.
## Appendix B (con’t)

### Featured Characters (By Episode)

**Episode Characters/Names**

4. Miss Claudette Pelage/ “Imaginary Enemies” - Run Time: ~54 min., split at min 27.
5. Dayanara Diaz/ “The Chickening” - Run Time: ~54 min., split at min 27.
12. Tiffany “Pennsatucky” Doggett/ “Fool Me Once” - Run Time: ~60 min., split at min 30.
Appendix C

Indicators:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
<th>V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. ☐ ☐</td>
<td>Pushed out or ran away from an abusive household</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. ☐ ☐</td>
<td>Petty hustles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. ☐ ☐</td>
<td>Drug-addicted and engaged in prostitution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. ☐ ☐</td>
<td>Selling drugs to support drug habit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. ☐ ☐</td>
<td>Record of arrest/occasional incarceration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above section (indicators 1-5) represents archetype 1- “Street Women”

6. ☐ ☐ | Abused or neglected as a child |
7. ☐ ☐ | Identified as a “problem child”/acts out |
8. ☐ ☐ | Violent when drinking alcohol |
9. ☐ ☐ | May be drug-addicted and have psychological problems |
10. ☐ ☐ | Unable to cope with current situation |

The above section (indicators 6-10) represent archetype 2- “Harmed and Harming Women”

11. ☐ ☐ | In a relationship with a violent man/partner |
12. ☐ ☐ | Recently ended a relationship with a violent man/partner |

The above section (indicators 11-12) represent archetype 3- “Battered Women”

13. ☐ ☐ | Use or sells drugs in connection with a boyfriend or family members |

The above section (indicator 13) represents archetype 4- “Drug-connected Women”

14. ☐ ☐ | Immediate economic circumstances/greed |

The above section (indicator 14) represents archetype 5- “Other.”
References


